

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 30 September 2015 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the
Offices of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson Ms Sarah Winter officially opened the meeting at 09:05 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter
Mr Peter Buttgens (left at 1pm)
Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Graham Jacobs
Mr Rowen Ruiters
Ms Belinda Mutti
Mr Stuart Hermansen

SW
PB
MS
GJ
RR
BM
SH

Members of Staff

Dr Errol Myburg EM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka ZS
Ms Jenna Lavin JL
Ms Penny Meyer PM
Mr Guy Thomas GT
Mr Jonathan Windvogel JW
Ms Katherine Robinson KR
Ms Heidi Boise HB
Ms Waseefa Dhansay WD
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec) OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec) LM

Visitors

Mr Trevor Thorold
Mr Henry Aikman
Ms Tanar Klitzner
Mr J de Villiers
Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr Ron Martin
Mr Rod Gurzynski

TT
HA
TK
JdV
JC
RM
RG

Mr Leonard Raymond LR
Ms Katherine Bleazard KB
Mr Andrew Berman AB
Mr Joe de Villiers JdV
Mr Ashley Lillie AL
Mr Russel Baker RB

Observers

3. Apologies

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 30 September 2015

The Committee approved the agenda dated 30 September 2015 with minor amendments.

5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Dated 9 September 2015

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- GJ: 11.10 and 13.4
- SW: 11.3

- MS: 11.4, 11.6, 13.1 and 19.2

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees some of these are carry overs from previous meeting?

The Legal Advisor (PM) reported on the outcome of the following appeal matters:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 186, Van Der Stel Street, Tulbagh: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 5028, Garmor House, 12 Plein Street, Cape Town: Section 34
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 14363, Lodge Laan 1, Wellington: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 55750, 12 Hugon Road, Claremont: Section 34

PM

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

It was noted that a Stop Works Order was issued for unauthorized or illegal work carried out at Erven 172892, 72893, 172895 and 172896, Cambridge Street, Harfield Village, Western Cape, and Erf 169378, 5 Carey Street Woodstock

PM

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

It was noted that there were no matters to report.

ZS

8.4 St Mary's Church, Stellenbosch.

PM reported that the Church had still not responded adequately to HWC's letter. Given that the Church has been given more than sufficient time to respond. The Committee recommended that the permit be withdrawn.

PM

8.5 Logistics for Special meeting: Rhodes

For noting

JL

8.6 Workshop on Heritage Statements

It was noted that an invitation has been circulated to Committee members for a workshop on heritage statements to be held on 8 October 2015. The Committee are requested to indicate their availability as soon as possible.

9. Standing items

9.1 Site Inspections

- There were no site inspections undertaken by Committee since the last meeting.
- There were no site inspections undertaken by staff since the last meeting.

PM

10. Appointments

10.1 None

MATTERS WERE DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Klein Constantia Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 11306

Case No: 15090103JW0209D

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Leonard Raymond and Mr Henry Aikman were present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (SW, GJ, PB and MS)

JW

11.2 Proposed Alterations to PHS Site, 75 Church Street, Elim: MA HM/OVERBERG/CAPE AGULHAS/ ELIM/FARM 237

Case No: 15072921KR0729M

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee supported the recommendations prepared by Ms Maureen Wolters.

The recommendations are to be forwarded to the owner advising that an application be prepared on this basis.

With respect to the recommendation that HWC prepare a set of specifications for new plastering and paint work, Mr Graham Jacobs indicated that he will be willing to provide the owner with advice.

The Committee requested that the case officer write to the municipality requesting its assistance in resolving drainage and level issues related to the roadway.

KR

11.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Erf 26439, Valkenberg Observatory: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/OBSERVATORY/ERF26439

Case No: 15091607JW0916M

An application for a permit photographs and plans were tabled.

SW recused herself and GJ took the chair for this item.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Trevor Thorold, Ms Katherine Bleazard and Ms Tarna Klitzner were present and took part in discussion.

In the discussion it was noted:

- The strong symmetrical qualities of the forecourt are acknowledged
- Concern was expressed regarding the location and extent of the parking area within the forecourt
- The large palm tree on axis with the main building will be relocated on the site.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the recommendations of the heritage architect subject to the following:

- That the final extent of the two bay parking area be resolved on site once the new platform is in place.
- That archaeological monitoring be conducted as per HWC's previous decision of 20 November 2013.
- That the palm tree should be re-positioned so that it responds to the axial geometry of the precinct.

JW

11.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Farm Fluerbaix, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/PTN 6 FARM 1040

Case No: 14081108JW0813

MS recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In the discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee noted the interim report prepared by the heritage architect, Mr Scurr.
- Mr Scurr indicated that due to concerns raised by the SIG the intention would be to revert to the August 2014 proposals which were for a solid masonry staircase.
- There are a number of outstanding issues identified in the August 2014 report and subsequent reports that still need to be resolved.

DECISION

The Committee supported the previously approved stair case proposals on condition that the treatment of the staircase has minimal intervention to the historical fabric.

The Committee requested clarity from the applicant on the timeframes for the completion of the broader outstanding issues and that this must be provided by the next BELCom meeting.

JW

11.5 Proposed Development on Erf 96660, Newlands Brewery, 3 Main Road Newlands: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ISA BREWERIES ERF 96660

Case No: 14111006GT1112M

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

Mr Andrew Berman and Mr Jake de Villiers were present and took part in discussion.

In the discussion it was noted that:

- Work had been undertaken that deviated from the approved plans.
- The Committee was of the opinion that it could not endorse the interim report until procedures for dealing with unauthorised work as outlined in the regulations have been followed.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request that the applicant provide reasons for why the permit should not be withdrawn. The Committee requested that these reasons be accompanied by a set of drawings clearly indicating the extent of the deviations and an assessment of heritage impacts

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed extension to the storage and kegging building.

GT

11.6 Proposed Alteration on Erf 4140, Ou Hoofgebou, Stellenbosch University, Ryeneveld Street: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 4140

Case No: 15081405HB0825M

MS recused himself. PB was not present when the matter was discussed.

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following:

- That the proposed lift shafts are permitted as long as the guidelines contained in the report prepared by Abrahamse, Scurr and Buttgens are adhered to.
- That detailed design drawings of the lifts be submitted to HWC and assessed by the case officer in terms of their adherence to the guidelines.

- That particular attention be given to the principle of visual transparency for the design of the proposed open lift located in the passageway of the newer 1964 section of the building.
- That the detailed design and construction work be overseen by the heritage architect.

HB

**11.7 Proposed Alteration, Excavation & Landscaping On Erf 2142, Leeuwenhof Estate, Oranjezicht: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ ORANJEZICHT/ERF 2142**

Case No: 15091608HB0916M

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-presentation.

Mr Trevor Thorold was present and took part in discussion.

In the discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee recommended that particular care be taken to address problems arising from rising damp only after the source of the damp problems has been addressed.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the redecoration and maintenance proposals to the manor house and outbuildings.

The Committee resolved to approve the landscaping proposals subject to archaeological monitoring. In the event of archaeological remains being uncovered necessitating the revision of the proposals, revised proposals must be submitted to HWC.

HB

**11.8 Proposed Alteration on Erf 17313, 75 Church Street Worcester: NM
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ BREDE VALLEY / WORCESTER / ERF 17313**

Case No: 15081211HB0812E

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-presentation.

Mr Ron Martin was present and participated in the discussions.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the sketch proposals in principle subject to the submission of detailed drawings being submitted to BELCom for approval

HB

**11.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions to PHS, Erf 656, 110 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 656**

Case No: 15090308KR0309E

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit (SW, GJ, MS and SH).

KR

**11.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions to PHS, Kuperhuis, Mamre Moravian Church, Werk: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MAMRE/ERF 973**

Case No: 15090804KR0916M

GJ recused himself.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals on condition that the work is supervised by the heritage architect.

KR

**11.11 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Erf 173, 28 Church Street, Tulbagh: NM
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/WITZENBERG/TULBAGH/ERF 173**

Case No: 15090702JW0909E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman and Mr Joe de Villiers were present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request further information in order to determine whether a site inspection is necessary. The Committee requested that the Fagan drawings of the pre and post 1970 reconstruction be circulated to Committee members for a decision by email.

JW

12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1358, 22 Chepstow Road, Green Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ ERF 1358

Case No: 15090410KR0409E

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided that the building and its context have insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal protection.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

KR

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 207, 69 Long Street, Piketberg: NM HM/BERGRIVER/PIKETBERG/ERF 207

Case No: 15080502JW0806E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade III C, and that it is situated within a context that does not warrant formal protection.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

KR

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 1079, 28 Vredehoek Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 2142

Case No: 15071004HB0715E

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (SW, MS, GJ and PB)

HB

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 827, 216 High Level Road, Sea Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN/ SEA POINT/ERF 827

Case No: 15082410HB0825E

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The committee resolved to undertake a site visit (SW, MS, GJ and PB).

HB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**13.1 Proposed Alterations on Ptn 6 of Farm 1121, Klein Constantia Estate: MA
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CONSTANTIA/PTN OF FARM 1121**

Case No: 150901708JW0918M

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

MS recused himself

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed alterations and additions as they will have minimal impact on heritage significance. These include the modification to the minstrel's gallery (preferred option 4), the revised proposals for the new pergola on the east elevation and the rebuilding of the existing 1930's pool.

Detailed drawings of the pergola must be included in the close-out report.

JW

**13.2 Proposed Guidelines for Namaqua House, Erf 116120, Corner Short Market and Burg Streets, Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ERF116120**

Case No: 15052607KR0526E

This item was discussed under 19.2.

KR

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations to Erf 582, 6 Homestead Way, Pinelands: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/PINELANDS**

Case No: 15040105KR0401E

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals

KR

**13.4 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions and Alterations to Erf 10373, Glen Dirk Reservoir, Klaassens Road, Constantia: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CONSTANTIA/ERF 10373**

Case No: 15040704KR0408E

Mr GJ recused himself.

Ms Katherine Robinson made a power-point presentation

In the discussion it was noted:

- The CPOA had objected to the proposals as there is a broader subdivision application which is *sub judice*.
- The Committee was of the opinion that the proposed alterations could be considered in terms of a discreet S34 application.
- The CPOA had requested that the matter not be heard given that their legal representative was not available to attend the meeting. The Committee was of the opinion that the CPOA's request was unreasonable.
- The CPOA had been informed that the matter was on the agenda.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade III B.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as they are sensitive to the historic fabric and retain the overall legibility of the original form. The work must be monitored by the heritage architect and a close out report must be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

KR

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 Proposed Works for Compulsory Works Order on Re-Erf 16.36, Longkloof Road, Hout Bay: NM

Ms Heidi Boise made a power-point presentation

The Committee resolved that the case officer will liaise with MS about a site visit. A representative of the City's Heritage Section and Roads Department must be invited to attend.

HB

19.2 Proposed Guidelines for Namaqua House, Erf 116120, Corner Short Market And Burg Streets, Cape Town:

MS recused himself

The Committee supported the guidelines as providing sufficient constraints and informants to guide the design development process.

KR

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **15:15**

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 21 October 2015

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____