

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 27 March 2013, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H10 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Mr Tim Hart	TH

Members of Staff

Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Christina Jikelo	JC
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Ms Ntombekhaya Nkoane	NN
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Troy Smuts	TS

Visitors

Mr S Hangone
Ms D Engelbrecht
Mr I Engel
Mr G Jacobs
Mr Malherbe
Mr M Scurr
Mr S Stadler
Mr J de Villiers
Mr A Berman
Mr O Mohamus

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Ms Tamar Grover	TG
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 27 February 2013

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

5. Disclosure of Interest

5.1 Item 10.1 Melanie Attwell.

5.2 Item 10.1 Tim Hart

6. Approval of Agenda

The Committee approved the agenda dated 27 March 2013 with a few additional items.

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

CvW and TS gave a report back on the Elim matter that was heard by the Appeals Committee.

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges Elim Pipeline, Vogelstruiskraal, Elim.

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-point presentation.

Representatives of the Moravian Church and the Friends of Elim were present and participated in the discussion.

In the discussion it was noted that:

- That HWC had requested a workshop some time ago; and that the workshop now proposed by the Church should include discussion of guidelines for the repair and addition to the houses.
- Elim is a wonderful place and is heritage to its community, to the Church, to the province and to the nation.
- That the mechanism for protecting and regulating the place was less important than that it should be protected in the interest of everyone although the Church and the community obviously have the greatest interest.
- That the workshop and the CMP process must involve all stakeholders including the community and the Friends of Elim.

RECOMMENDATION

The Committee recommends that the stop works order be withdrawn by HWC and that the construction of the remainder of the pipeline be condoned. This is subject to the implementation of clauses 1, 2.1 and 2.2 proposed in the letter from Mr Hangone written on behalf of the church, dated 20 March 2013.

TS/CJ

8.3 Checklist for Application- Related Decision- Making

This matter will stand over until the CEO is back from leave.

8.4 Overstrand Municipality Issues of Jurisdiction

Mr Hall will meet with the Municipal Manager and Mr John Simson to clarify issues of jurisdiction especially with respect to Section 34 and Section 31. It is requested that this be undertaken as a matter of urgency.

8.5 UCT, Middle Campus, Economics Building

A date has been set for a meeting between Mr Haupt and the CEO.

SD.

8.6 Circulation of Agenda.

The Committee noted that the agenda is not being circulated to the officials of the City of Cape Town or of other local authorities and it is required that the agenda gets circulated to them.

It was also requested that the agenda gets circulated the Friday before the meeting.

OD/LM

9. Appointments

9.1 The Committee noted the appointment for item 8.2 set for 11H00.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposal for Minor Works including the Re-Thatching and Lime Washing of the Barn, Minor Work to Existing Guard house on Erf 28002, De Meule, Rhodes Avenue , Mowbray: MA

A report and drawings prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff, dated March 2013, Landscape Development Plan, prepared by TKLA, dated 29 November 2011, an application prepared by K.P Blackwell, dated 17 March 2013 and a letter prepared by Melanie Attwell dated 19th March 2013 were tabled

Mr Calvin van Wijk made a power-point presentation

TH recused himself. MA recused herself and joined the applicant.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The committee was disappointed that the guard house is being retained and not being replaced or removed.
- The committee hopes that there will not be any further cost cutting and ad-hoc reduction of the work already approved.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II and is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the work to the barn and guard house and to the amended landscape plan.

TG/CvW

W.10.2 Outcome of Court Case: Akkerhuisie, Mamre.

Drawings (dwg no: MAk/A/02) prepared by ARCON Architects & Heritage Consultants was tabled

It was noted that:

- The poor condition and ad-hoc alterations including paving and rain water disposal within the werf are of great concern and should be part of a section 27 application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal and requires that the work be supervised by Mr Graham Jacobs and that the future interpretation of the werf include a note about the reconstruction of this building.

The Committee requires the submission of the completion report within three months of completion.

SD

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 None

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.12.1 Proposal for Partial Internal Demolition and Addition of a New First Floor on Erf 455, 84 Waterkant Street, De Waterkant, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN/DE WATERKANT/ERF 455

Case No: 130305TG07E

An application prepared by Joe De Villiers, dated 28 February 2013, plans and photographs were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The application was incomplete.

INTERIM COMMENT

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIB

The Committee resolved that the application is incomplete. Drawings of the October 2012 approval, side elevations and contextual photographs need to be submitted and Committee members will go on site.

TG/JW

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions to Existing Buildings on Mooikelder, Farm 501/02, Main Road, Paarl: MA
HM/PAARL/MOOIKELDER/FARM 501/02**

Revised plans was tabled

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

The architect, Johan Malherbe, was present and took part in the discussions.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The proposed roof, its height and scale, is regarded as simply too large ('mammoth') and the committee made suggestions in order to reduce its scale and so to minimise its impact without reducing the floor area desired.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II

The Committee resolved not to approve the application

RN

**W.12.3 Proposed Alterations on Erf 237, Kortsand Straat 31, Elim: NM
HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

Case No: 130315RN05E

An application prepared by B Temmers, dated 28 January 2013 and plans was tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building appears to be very intact.

INTERIM COMMENT

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection.

RN

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 None

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition of a Cottage on Erf 83, Voortrekker Street, Velddrift:
NM
HM/VELDDRIFT/ERF 83**

Case No: 130219ZS41E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin Heritage Consultancy, dated 15 February 2013 was tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Velddrift Heritage Foundation objects to the demolition.\

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as the building is ungradable and does not warrant formal protection.

The Velddrift Heritage Foundation is to be informed of the right to appeal by the case officer.

ZS

**E.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition of Erven 8504, 8505 and 8513, Zonnebloem in Pontac, Nelson and Aspeling Streets, District Six: NM
HM/DISTRICT SIX/ERVEN 8504/8505/8513**

Case No: 121011ZS11M

A Heritage Statement prepared by Andrew Berman and Jake de Villiers, Heritage Consultants, dated March 2013 was tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation

Mssrs Berman and de Villiers were present and took part in the discussion. A representative of the owners was also present and made certain comments; and did Mr Ron Martin, a previous employee of the old NMC who had some knowledge and opinions regarding the matter.

In discussion it was noted that:

- SAHRA is opposed to the demolition of the buildings.
- This remnant of district six is a significant one and has visual and historical links with the nearby St Phillips church and Chapel Street school.
- There is no proposal that triggers S38.
- Three separate S34 applications must be submitted.

Comment

The Committee resolved that the buildings are derelict and beyond repair and therefore reluctantly will approve their demolition after following the Memorandum of Agreement process with SAHRA. The case officer is to ensure that the processes and requirements of the MoU are followed.

ZS

E.11.3 Proposed Total Demolition to Erf 54, 1 Botany Lane, Bantry Bay, Cape Town: MA HM/BANTRY BAY/ERF 54

Case No: 130130TG31E

An application, Record of Decision dated 22 August 2008, comments from the Sea Point Fresnaye Bantry Bay Ratepayers and Residents Association, plans and photographs were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

INTERIM COMMENT

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection (SW and MA).

NN

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.12.1 None

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS
The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE
The meeting adjourned at 14:45

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 24 April 2013

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____