# APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,

BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom) Held on Thursday, 26 July 2017 in the 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,

Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00

### 1. Opening and Welcome

Ms Karin Dugmore Ström, the Chairperson officially opened the meeting at 09:10 and welcomed everyone present.

### 2. Attendance

| Members                        |         | Members of Staff      |    |
|--------------------------------|---------|-----------------------|----|
| Mr Mike Scurr                  | MS      | Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka | ZS |
| Ms Karin Dugmore Ström         | KDS     | Mr Jonathan Windvogel | JW |
| Mr Peter Büttgens              | PB      | Ms Katherine Robinson | KR |
| Ms Belinda Mutti               | BM      | Mr Andrew September   | AS |
| Ms Janine de Waal              | JdW     | Ms Heidi Boise        | HB |
| Mr Graham Jacobs (arrived at 1 | 2:20)GJ | Ms Waseefa Dhansay    | WD |
|                                |         | Mr Zethembe Khuluse   | ZK |
|                                |         | Mr Olwethu Dlova      | OD |
|                                |         | Ms Busisiwe Menzela   | BM |
|                                |         |                       |    |

### **Visitors**

| Ms Masaorna Mapherson  | MM   | Ms Afisa Umutoni     | ΑU  |
|------------------------|------|----------------------|-----|
| Ms Quahnita Samie      | QS   | Mr Osman Shaboodien  | OS  |
| Ms Jacky Poking        | JP   | Mr Johan Malherbe    | JM  |
| Ms Anja Lareman        | AL   | Mr Shlomi Azar       | SA  |
| Mr Chris Mood          | CM   | Mr Henry Aikman      | HA  |
| Ms Melissa Groenink    | MG   | Mr Mike Viljoen      | MV  |
| Ms Bridget O'Donoghue  | BO'D | Ms Ursula Rigby      | UR  |
| Ms Liz Westby-Nunn     | LW-N | Mr Studer Delson     | SD  |
| Mr Ashley Lillie       | AL   | Mr Andre de Villiers | AdV |
| Ma Dane Duminias       | DD   | Mr Marrio Bonadei    | MB  |
| Ms Catheya Bonadei     | CB   | Mr Trevor Drabbe     | TD  |
| Mr Rhys Meredith       | RM   | Ms Natalie Sherren   | NS  |
| Dr Stephen Townsend    | ST   | Mr Johan Cornelius   | JC  |
| Ms Geraldine Goncalves | GG   |                      |     |

### Observers

None

### 3. Apologies

| Ms Colette Scheermeyer | CSc |
|------------------------|-----|
| Ms Penelope Meyer      | PM  |
| Mr Mayiji Nyikosa      | MN  |
| Mr Gaarith Williams    | GW  |

### 4. Approval of Agenda

### **4.1** Dated 20 July 2017

The Committee approved the agenda dated 20 July 2017 with additional items.

### 5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

### 5.1 Dated 24 May 2017

The Committee approved the minutes dated 24 May 2017 with minor amendments.

### 5.2 Dated 28 June 2017

The Committee approved the minutes dated 28 June 2017 without corrections.

### 5.3 Dated 20 July 2017

The Committee approved the minutes dated 20 June 2017 without corrections.

### 6. Disclosure of Interest

- KDS: item 12.8
- MS: item 12.3, 12.8 and 12.11
- PB: item 19.1GJ: item 13.3
- JdW item 12.3

### 7. Confidential Matters

### **7.1** None

### 8. Administrative Matters

### 8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

ZS reported back on the outcomes of the following Appeals matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 55166, 10 Feldhausen Avenue Claremont: Section 34
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 55165, 8 Feldhausen Avenue, Claremont: Section 34
- Proposed New Swimming Pool, School Hall, Additional Classrooms and Vehicular Thoroughfare with Parking on Erven 333, 2281 & 2281 & 2907, St Cyprian's School, Oranjezicht: Section 38(4)

### 8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

There was nothing to report.

### 8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

There was nothing to report

PM

- 8.4 Proposed Total Demolition of structure on Erf 2759, 1 Chelsea Road, Vredehoek
- 8.5 Proposed Total Demolition of structure on Erf 2592-RE, 25 Aandblom Road, Vredehoek

### 8.6 BELCom New Members

It was noted that the appointment of a BELCom member with suitable landscape heritage experience was under consideration.

### 9. Standing Items

### 9.1 Site Inspections

The following site inspections undertaken by members and staff were noted:

- Proposed Restoration & Alteration on Farm 579, Farm Druk My Niet, Bo-Dal Road, Paarl
- Proposed Total Demolition of Structures on Erf 1441, 10 Leeuwenhof Road, Oranjezicht
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 887, 4 Rugby Road, Oranjezicht
- Proposed Renovation and Additions, Erven 1389 and 1390, Queens Hotel, 2 Dock Road, Cape Town
- 350 Main Road, Paarl
- 18 Kildare Road, Newlands
- 26 Hope Street, Gardens

### 10. Appointments

**10.1** The Committee noted the appointments for item 12.8 set for 11:00, item 12.4 set for 11:30 and item 12.11 set for 14:00.

### MATTERS DISCUSSED

### 11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

# 11.1 Proposed Restoration & Alteration on Farm 579, Farm Druk My Niet, Bo-Dal Road, Paarl: MA

HM/CAPE WINELNDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/FARM 579

Case No: 17050204HB0503M

JdW, GJ, PB, and MS reported back on their site inspection. Refer also to the site inspection report submitted by GJ.

Mr Johan Malherbe and Ms Anja Lareman were present and took part in the discussion.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

- GJ noted that the site inspection confirmed that the fire has done extensive damage.
- The site is a PHS. However, damage done in the early 2000's has been further exacerbated by the recent fire damage, and together has impacted on heritage significance. The resource can therefore now be considered in its current form as equivalent to grade IIIA.

- Emergency measures taken to protect the building have included the stabilising
  of walls, and the protection of the exposed softbrick walling with a scratch-coat
  of plaster. It is problematic that a cement based plaster has been used, and it is
  noted that this was not authorised by HWC (refer to site report for further
  information).
- The applicants requested that HWC attend to the issue of the wine making facility as a first priority in the interest of economic productivity. Comments on the wine cellar included the following:
  - The committee noted that I&AP's had raised concerns in writing that alternative design approaches had not been presented. An alternative was then submitted to HWC on 22 June 2017. The Committee noted that these revised designs had not yet been circulated to I&AP's.
  - The Committee supports the insertion of the steel portals to support a new roof, as the structural integrity of the soft brick walling has been compromised by the fire.
  - The Committee raised concerns about the replacement of thatch with corrugated iron. However, as the building is in a truly high fire risk zone, the use of corrugated iron has some merit in this case. Furthermore, the use of corrugated sheeting on a steel structure provides an architecturally legible design response, which at the same time is an appropriate attitude to historic layering.

### RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised proposals for the wine cellar as indicated in drawing numbers 2201 Rev B, dated 20 June 2017 subject to:

- Notes being added to the submission indicating that:
  - The use of considerably softer and therefore more compatible mortars and renders, without the inclusion of chicken wire mesh.
  - These mortars and renders preferably excluding any Portland cement.
  - Appropriate formulations for these mortars and renders being subject to prior testing on site by a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience approved by HWC.
- A closeout report by this suitably qualified architect with heritage experience, recording step by step the remedial interventions, is to be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion.
- The Committee noted that it is a requirement that I&AP's are provided with copies of the revised designs (2201 Rev B, dated 20 June 2017).

HB

# 11.2 Proposed Addition & Alteration at Erf 224, 29 Piet Retief Street, Tulbagh: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/TULBAGH/ERF 224

Case No: 16112205HB1215E

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

HB

11.3 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Demolition, Erf 66679 - 59 Wolfe Street,

Wynberg: MA

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WYNBERG/ ERF 66679

Case No: 17011811WD0119E

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

WD

11.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions (motivation for deviations and rectification plan) to Babushka Barn, Farm Haasendal 222, Hazendal, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/FARM HAASENDAL 222

Case No: 16100502AS1005E

Previous Revocation Letter, Initial Letter to HWC, previous HWC response on the matter, and as-built drawings were tabled.

Mr Andrew September gave a PowerPoint presentation addressing drawing numbers HAZ 100B Rev 01 dated 6 January 2017 and HAZ-B 002 Rev 1 dated 22 November 2016, which involves mitigation measures for the barn known as Babushka.

Mr Ashley Lillie, Mr Shlomi Azar and Mr Chris Wood were present and took part in the discussion.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

 The appointment of a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience to conduct a monitoring brief.

### RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised proposals for Babushka (without any "links" involving the proposed play centre) as indicated in drawing numbers HAZ 100B Rev 01, dated 6 January 2017 and HAZ-B 002 Rev 1, dated 22 November 2016 subject to:

- The use of considerably softer and therefore more compatible mortars and renders without the inclusion of chicken wire mesh.
  - All mortars and renders are preferably to exclude any Portland cement. Appropriate formulations for these mortars and renders will be subject to prior testing on site by a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience approved by HWC.
- A closeout report by the suitably qualified architect with heritage experience recording step by step the remedial interventions is to be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion.

AS

### 12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

# 12.1 Proposed Total Demolition of Structures on Erf 1441, 10 Leeuwenhof Road, Oranjezicht: MA

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 1441

Case No: 1702280KR0405E

GJ, PB, and MS reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Andre de Villiers was present and took part in the discussion.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

- The HWC permit for alterations and additions to the property was issued in late 2016.
- The building's intrinsic significance is debatable due to the level of alterations made to the original structure. After the recent site visit, Committee members were of the opinion that the building is IIIC (the CoCT grade is IIIB).
- The site lies within an approved HPOZ. The existing building contributes to its immediate environment in terms of scale and form, even though it is largely not visible from the street.
- CoCT do not approve the proposed demolition. CIBRA gave support in principle but noted that they would like to approve a replacement building.

### **RECORD OF DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed demolition subject to the following:

- The replacement design proposal is not approved in its current form.
- A revised design informed by appropriate design indicators, generated by the site and its context needs to be submitted to the Committee for assessment.
   Design indicators are to be compiled by an appropriately qualified heritage practitioner.

KR

# 12.2 Proposed Total Demolition at Erf 50317, 18 Kildare Road, Newlands: MA HM/CAPE METRPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 50317

Case No: 16101104HB0418E

GJ, PB, and MS reported back on their site inspection

A Heritage Statement prepared by Bridget O'Donoghue dated 11 April 2017 was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Bridget O'Donoghue was present and took part in the discussion.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

• The options presented by the applicant's architect, as varied responses to the immediate and nearby contexts, which include mostly 1930's pitched roofed houses.

### RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the complete demolition subject to:

Option B being followed through and submitted to HOMs for approval

HB

## 12.3 Proposed Total Demolition of structure on Erf 386-RE, 273 Longmarket Street, Bo Kaap: MA

### HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BO KAAP/ERF 386-RE

Case No: 17013102KR0201E

Application documentation, Heritage Report prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, CoCT HRS comment, SAHRA comment & Bo Kaap Civic and Ratepayers Association comment were tabled.

MS and JdW recused themselves and left the room.

Ms Katherine Robinson gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Ms Quahnita Samie, Mr Osman Shaboodien and Ms Jacky Poking were present and took part in the discussion.

The Committee was not quorate for this item and the final decision will be taken by email.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

- The Bo-Kaap Civic requested to see a copy of the latest report prepared by Vida Memoria Heritage Consultants (dated 20 July 2017). The case officer will forward the report. It was noted that there will be no further public participation on the demolition issue, or on issues of social significance.
- The building has been graded as Not Conservation-worthy by the CoCT and it is located within the proposed HPOZ.
- The site is a very prominent one on the rise of upper Longmarket Street, forming the edge of the Bo-Kaap and one of the links to the mountain.
- The Bo-Kaap Civic has provided verbal narratives which provide some evidence of local residents' sense of the site's importance. These narratives have been balanced by research provided by the heritage practitioner who concluded that the evidence and public attitude towards the site are varied with some of the community not attaching value to the social role of the site.
- The Bo-Kaap Civic initiated an extended public participation process. This has highlighted that historically, this was a site which provided much prized street connectivity which is evident throughout the Bo-Kaap. They have requested that BELCom consider this Bo-Kaap quality in the assessment process.
- The Bo-Kaap Civic have not provided a compelling argument for retaining the relic parts on the 1930's building which lie embedded within the current structure.
- The proposal for the substitute building was included with the original HWC submission package.
- The social importance of the site has been recorded in depth.

### RECORD OF DECISION

• The case officer must forward the report dated 20 July 2017 by Vida Memoria Heritage Consultants to the Bo-Kaap Civic.

- The building cannot be graded from an intrinsic architectural significance point of view, as it has been reconfigured in ways that completely obliterate any original or residual design intent.
- There is insufficient evidence to support the memorialisation of particular past uses of the building in its built form going forward. Nonetheless, the quality of street friendliness, and the important location of the site itself are reasons for care being taken to ensure that these issues are incorporated into to replacement designs.
- The Committee support the application for the complete demolition of all structures on the site provided that:
  - A revised design which shows all proposed boundary treatments and which ensures that such boundary treatments provide positive interfaces with all street and mountain edges is submitted to HWC for approval.
  - That the stoep/veranda shown on the east (Longmarket Street face) must be wrapped around the building so it is equally visible from the lane to the south.

KR

# 12.4 Proposed Total Demolition of 3 structures on Erven 585, 592 and Rem Erf 484, Honeydew Farm, Paarl: MA

HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERVEN 585, 592 & REM 484

Case No: 17052603KR0530E

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

KR

# 12.5 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 25447, 200 Lower Main Road, Observatory: MA

HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/ OBSERVATORY/ERF 25447

Case No: 17021601HB0327E

Draft Heritage Statement prepared by Ursula Rigby dated 4 July 2017 was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

- The double garage door on Lower Main Road is not suitable on a pedestrian footway in a HPOZ
- The design indicators establish an important visual datum line at canopy level:
   a second visual datum line must be expressed at double storey height, as
   established by the parapets of nearby double storey buildings.
- Generally speaking the architectural expression below the double storey datum line should be more restrained and consistent with architecture of the streetscape, thus restricting the unusual geometries and alternating colours proposed by the architects to the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor and up.

### **RECORD OF DECISION**

The Committee resolved, in the light of the heritage report submitted and which it accepts, to approve the demolition subject to:

- The augmentation of design indicators as per the discussion notes above.
- Amendments to the design proposal as submitted to fit with same.

- The augmented design indicators and revised designs are to be submitted to the Committee for approval prior to the issue of a permit.

HB

# 12.6 Proposed Total Demolition of structure on Erf 2759, 1 Chelsea, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ERF 2759

Case No: 17042407KR0503M

Application documents, Heritage Document prepared by Johan Cornelius dated 23 March 2017 and email correspondence showing no comments received in 30 commenting period by CoCT and CIBRA, Letter by HWC were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

• The application is currently in a public participation advertisement period.

### RECORD OF DECISION

The matter is therefore withdrawn until such time that the public participation period lapses.

**KR** 

# 12.7 Proposed Total Demolition of structure on Erf 2592-RE, 25 Aandblom Road, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ERF 2592-RE

Case No: 17042408KR0503M

Application documents, Heritage document prepared by Johan Cornelius dated 23 March 2017 and email correspondence showing no comments received in 30 commenting period by CoCT and CIBRA, Letter by HWC were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Mr Johan Cornelius was present and took part in the discussion.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

The application is currently in a public participation advertisement period.

### INTERIM COMMENT

The matter is therefore withdrawn until such time that the public participation period lapses.

KR

## 12.8 Proposed Total Demolition of the Maitland Swimming Pool, Erf 174308, 21A Royal Road, Maitland: NM

HM/CAPE TOWN METOPOLITAN/ERF 174308

Case No: 17031008KR0313M

Maitland Swimming Pool Motivation by Karin Ström dated 03-12-2014, revised application documents submitted by the CoCT for demolition, DOCOMOMO comment; comments from the local community were tabled.

KDS and MS recused themselves and left the room. PB took the chair for this item.

Ms Katherine Robinson gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Ms Masaorna Mapherson and Ms Afisa Umutoni were present and took part in the discussion.

The Committee was not quorate for this item and the final decision will be taken by email.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

- The CoCT has given the site a grading of no heritage significance. BELCom proposed an alternative grading of IIIB in a 2014 decision.
- The Committee is of the opinion that this grading remains unchanged in light of the outcome of a public participation process which highlights the high social and historical heritage significance of the site, its use and the structures.
- The Committee noted with concern the further degradation of the site since the 2014 HWC decision and issuing of a permit. This neglect does not change the heritage significance of the site.

### **RECORD OF DECISION**

The Committee does not approve the demolition of the site or any future change of community orientated social and/or recreation use, as any change in use will have a negative impact on the heritage significance on the site.

KR

# 12.9 Proposed Total Demolition of structure on Erf 1357, 13 High Level Street, Green Point: NM

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF 1357

Case No: 17051813KR0619E

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

KR

# 12.10 Proposed Total Demolition at Erf 28565, 47 Mount Street, Mowbray: NM HM / CAPE METROPOLITAN/ MOWBRAY/ERF 28565

Case No: 17022009HB0301E

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

HB

### 12.11 Re-application for a granted Total Demolition permit on Erf 97471, 4 Lemon

Lane, Newlands: NM

**HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ERF 97471** 

**Case No:** 17050901KR0510E

An application including documents, CoCT comments, Newlands Ratepayers comment, letter from Cullinan and Associates, email correspondence from previous/now co-owner and demolition permit issued, were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman, Ms Melissa Groenink, Ms Geraldine Goncalves and Mr Mike Viljoen were present and took part in the discussion.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

- Committee members agreed that the system of streams and planting contributes to the special qualities of this section of the proposed HPOZ.
- In keeping with heritage management elsewhere in the City, the Committee considers that natural heritage of Newlands should be taken into consideration.
- ZS noted that significances differ and that the NHRA requires that a totality of significance should be considered.
- The issue of whether this Committee has the mandate to make conditions in this specific instance.
- HA noted that streams are protected by CoCT in terms of the ERHM section's mandate.
- HA noted that there is little built fabric of heritage significance in the nearby environs.
- The representative for the NRA stressed that the organisation has no doubt that the streams are heritage resources, and noted that streams are not in need of rehabilitation in this particular zone.
- The NRA requested that the Committee do a site visit with I&AP's. They requested the Committee to pay particular attention to surveyed water course levels and consider these levels in relation to proposed basement construction.
- The owner noted that the site is zoned GR2.
- It was pointed out that comment from the NRA arrived at HWC one day late. However, Cullinan and Associates correspondence was not late.

### INTERIM COMMENT

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection. (KDS, BM, MS)

KR

# 12.12 Proposed Total Demolition of structure on 72 Barnet Street, Gardens: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ERF 95451

Case No: 17042411KR0504M

Application documents, CoCT comment, CIBRA comment and a supporting document prepared by Johan Cornelius, dated 17 April 2017 were tabled.

Ms Katherine Robinson gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

The application is currently in a public participation advertisement period.

### INTERIM COMMENT

The matter is therefore withdrawn until such time that the public participation period lapses.

KR

## 12.13 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 887, 4 Rugby Road, Oranjezicht: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 887

Decision taken via email was recorded.

#### **CONFIRMATION OF DECISION**

The Committee confirmed that the decision taken by email on 30 June 2017 is ratified.

The total demolition of the building with no conditions pertaining to the demolition was approved, given its lack of heritage significance and the fact that a replacement building will not impact on a heritage environment.

HB

# 12.14 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 4536, Main Road, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF 4536

BELCom members to report back on the site inspection undertaken.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

HB

# 12.15 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 26178, Corner Street, Michael's and Seymour Streets, Observatory: NM HM/OBSERVATORY/ERF 26178

Case No: 17067804ZK0630E

Report accompanying annexure A prepared by Claire Abrahamse, dated April 2017 to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

7K

# 13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

# 13.1 Proposed Addition and Alteration to Ptn 17 Farm 1685, Ptn of Goede Hoop Farm, Helshoogte Road: NM CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ BOSCHENDAL/PTN 17 FARM 1685

Case No: 16111707HB1123E

Outbuilding: Interim Report: Re-use / Repair of Original Fabric prepared by Stuart Hermansen dated 14 June 2017; De Goede Hoop Farm Report 1: Structural

Investigation of the Outbuilding(Stables) of early 18th C prepared by H.N. Vos dated June 2004 & De Goede Hoop Farm Report 2: Historical Survey of the Owners prepared by H.N. Vos dated September 2004 to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

HB

# 13.2 Restoration and Additional Conservatory floor added at roof level on Erven 1389 & 1390, Queen's Hotel, 2 Dock Road, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERVEN 1389 &1390

**Case No:** 17060516KR0609E

PB, MS, JdW and KDS reported back on their site inspection.

Among other things, the following was discussed:

- A detailed set of as-built drawings are required to inform design development.
- The conservatory style addition at rooftop level is supported in principle, however this requires extensive design development and detailing:
   The design should take cognisance of the proposed function as well as the opportunities arising from this, and pay particular attention to the visual impact of the building seen from various angles as well as the plan form of the building.
- The introductions of some double volume spaces are supported in principle but the extent of these needs to be greatly limited.
- The use of concrete construction should be limited to a minimum and rational fire design principles applied to steel structures as the preferred structural solution.
- The second storey masonry insertion needs to be further considered, such that it integrates better with the rooftop intervention.
- Specification and detailing of inserts and interventions affecting heritage fabric is to be provided.

### INTERIM COMMENT

The committee resolved to support the proposal in principle, subject to the applicant attending to the concerns raised in the discussion.

KR

# 13.3 Proposed Demolition of a Garage and Partial Alterations to adjacent Storerooms, Erf 173903, Rondebosch: NM HM/ RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 173903

Case No: 17041811ZK0620E

Application documents, CoCT comments, I&AP's comments; proposed building plans and elevations, objections; internal images of garage; streetscape and external images to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

KR

### 13.4 Proposed Partial Demolition, Addition and Alteration at Erf 496, 118 Dummer

Street, Somerset West: NM

HM/ CAPE METROPOLITAN / SOMERSET WEST/ ERF 496

Case No: 17060501HB0704E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Raymond Smith dated June 2017 to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

HB

# 13.5 Proposed Alterations at Erf 225, 20 Van der Stel Street, The Tulbagh Boutique Heritage Hotel, Tulbagh: NM

HM/CAPE WINELANDS /WITZENBERG/ TULBAGH

Case No: 17070417HB0705E

Draft Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates dated July 2017 to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

HB

## 13.6 Completion Report for Erf 163045, Corner Buitengracht and Castle Streets, Cape Town: NM

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ERF 163045

Case No: 13112NN46E

Completion Report dated July 2017 prepared by A. Berman of Urban Design Services cc to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

KR

# 13.7 Proposed Additions & Alterations at Erf 1388, Corner Alfred and Stanley Streets, Cape Town: NM

**HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERF 1388** 

Case No: 17070501HB0705E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Stephen Townsend dated 28 June 2017 was tabled.

Ms Heidi Boise gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Dr Stephen Townsend was present and took part in the discussion.

### **RECORD OF DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as shown on drawings numbered 101 Rev 01 dated 25 May 2017, 102 Rev 01 dated 23 May 2017, 201 Rev 01 dated 31 May 2017, 202 Rev 01 dated 31 May 2017, 303 Rev 01 dated 14 June 2017, 401 Rev 01 dated 19 June 2017, 2005 Rev 02 dated 10 May 2017, 2003 Rev 02 dated 29 May 2017, 204 Rev 01 dated 29 May 2017.

The Committee endorses the condition that a heritage practitioner with suitable architectural experience is appointed to provide specifications and supervision of the heritage work. A close out report by the heritage practitioner is to be submitted to HWC within 30 days of final completion.

HB

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- 14.1 None
- PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT 15
- 15.1 None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- 16.1 None
- 17 **HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**
- 17.1 None
- 18 **PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**
- 18.1 None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- 19.1 Advice on deviation from previous approval of high-rise structure on Erf 173153, The Modern, Corner of Han Strydom, Bree, Mechau and Bree Streets, Cape Town CBD: NM

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERF 173153

Case No: 15030606KR0311M

Structural Report, 2 variations of structural design options, the original heritage statement prepared by Bridget O'Donogue dated 7 April 2015, BELCOM letter, DOCOMOMO original comments and latest comment to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

KR

#### 20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 Section 31 - Unauthorised Work at Erf 737, 15 Adderley Street, Stanford: NM HM/OVERBERG /OVERSTRAND/ STANFORD

Case No: 17050912HB0526E

Drawings prepared by Vos Coetzee drawing no. 1702R1/01 - 03 dated 25 April 2017 to be tabled.

The matter was postponed to the next additional BELCom meeting.

HB

| 21.   | NON    | COMPL | IANCE |
|-------|--------|-------|-------|
| Z I . | 14(1)4 | COMPL | JANGE |

**21.1** None

### 22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

### 23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: 18:00

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 15 August 2017

CHAIRPERSON\_\_\_\_\_ DATE\_\_\_\_

SECRETARY\_\_\_\_\_ DATE\_\_\_