

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 25 March 2015 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09:15 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Rowen Ruiters
Mr Graham Jacobs
Ms Belinda Mutti
Mr Michael Scurr (left at 15:00)

SW
SH
RR
GJ
BM

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall
Ms Penny Meyer
Mr Jonathan Windvogel
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)
MS Mr Guy Thomas
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)
Mr Ronny Nyuka
Mr Andrew September

AH
PM
JW
ZS
LM
GT
OD
RN
AS

Visitors

Mr D Rennie
Mr Piet Louw
Mr Schalk Carstens
Mr David Tyrrel
Mr Simon Mountford
Dr Elzet Albertyn
Mr Chris Snelling
Ms Gill Susman
Ms Sjanel Martin (CoCT)

DR
PL
SC
DT
SM
EA
CS
GS
SM

Mr L van der Merwe
Mr Leon Bester
Mr Johan Papendorp
Ms Mandy Gertholz
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Ron Martin
Ms Lize Malan
Mr William Baker
Mr Jeremy Acton

LvdM
LB
JP
MG
HA
RM
LM
WB
JA

Observers

None

3. Apologies

3.1 Mr Peter Buttgens PB

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 25 March 2015

The Committee approved the agenda dated 25 March 2015 with some amendments.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Dated 25 February 2015

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor changes.

6. Disclosure of Interest:

- MS: W.13.1, W.13.3, W.13.5 and W13.7
- BM: W.11.2

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The Legal Advisor, PM reported back on the following appeal matters:

- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 15163, 22 Coronation Road, Walmer Estate: Section 34; and
- Proposed Installation of Sculpture, Riebeeck Square, Erf 152670, Corner Bree & Shortmarket Streets, Cape Town: Section 27

And the CEO reported back on the Erf 1444, 24 Davenport Road, Vredehoek Tribunal hearing.

AH/ZS

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

There were no new matters to report back.

AH/ZS

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

There were no new matters to report back.

ZS

8.4 Building Fabric Collapse, Mamre Church Precinct (Lang Huis and Barn)

GJ reported back that he had submitted an incident report recommending that the work be approved.

GT/KR

8.5 St Mary's Church, Stellenbosch.

PM will take up the matter for the next meeting.

PM

8.6 Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 11306, Klein Constantia, Klein Constantia Street, Paarl

The Committee discussed the outcomes of the court case in preparation for consideration of the application under Item W.13.4.

JW

8.7 Paarl Main Road

It was reported that unauthorised work had been undertaken and that this may be a repeated violation on the same site by Mr Raymond.

DECISION

It was agreed that:

- It be checked whether the alteration is within the declared area;
- If so a stop works order be issued; and
- The CEO consider what steps if any should be taken.

ZS

8.8 Revised HWC Schedule of Meetings 2015

The revised HWC meeting schedule was tabled for noting.

AH

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site Inspections

This matter was held over for the following meeting.

10. Appointments

- 10.1** The Committee noted the appointment for Item E.11.1 set for 11H00 and W.13.8 set for 11H30.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 115, 12 Meadway, Pinelands: NM HM/PINELANDS/ERF 115

Case No: 14091113JW1125E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans (drawing no: 14.007.1, 14.007.3 and 14.007.4) prepared by DAI, dated February 2014 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Chris Snelling was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

JW

**W.11.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1253, Old Potter's inn, 16 Main Road, Greyton: NM
HM/GREYTON/ERF 1253**

Case No: 15021307JW0216E

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

BM recused herself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Mandy Gerntholtz was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

JW

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**W.12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1146, 61 Waterfront Drive, Knysna: NM
HM/KNYSNA/ERF 1146**

Case No: 14112711JW1127M

Comments from conservation bodies were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr D Rennie and Mr L van der Merwe were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The local conservation bodies had been requested to substantiate their opinion that the building is worthy of formal protection.
- The submissions from the local Heritage Advisory Committee, Aesthetics Committee and Appeals Subcommittee do not provide any substantiation of their opinions.

DECISION

The Committee decided the building to be ungradable as it does not meet any of the criteria listed under Section 3.3 of the NHRA.

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition.

JW

**W.12.2 Proposed Total demolition, Erf 97055, 1 Boundary Terrace Road, Newlands:
NM
HM/NEULANDS/ERF 97055**

Case No: 14080104RN0805E

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda at the request of the applicant.

RN

**W.12.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Ptn of Erf 2775, Main Street, Clanwilliam: NM
HM/CLANWILLIAM/PTN OF ERF 2775**

Case No: 15022508AS0225E

An application for a permit and Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin were tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ron Martin was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee would welcome additional detailed information to further clarify the intrinsic and the contextual value of the building. However, it was of the opinion that there was sufficient information to determine that the building has heritage value and that demolition could not be supported.
- The building retains sufficient historic fabric, scale and form to warrant retention within the streetscape.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIC and contributes to the character of the Main Road streetscape.

The Committee resolved not to approve the demolition.

AS

**W.12.4 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 279, 69 Cliff Street, De Kelders: NM
HM/DE KELDERS/ERF 279**

Case No: 15031116AS0311M

An application for a permit and Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin were tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ron Martin was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building has been graded IIC in terms of approved Overstrand Heritage Survey.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve demolition given that the building has been substantially altered and that there is absence of a heritage context worthy of formal protection.

AS

**W.12.5 Proposed total Demolition, Erf 542, Estate Late HD Bernard, 17 Marine Drive, Hermanus: NM
HM/HERMANUS/ERF 542**

Case No: 15030602AS0311M

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

Dr Elzet Albertyn was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be ungradable in terms of the criteria listed in Section 3.3 of the NHRA.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition.

AS

**W.12.6 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 229, Visser Street, Clanwilliam: NM
HM/CLANWILLIAM/PTN OF ERF 2775**

Case No: 15022507AS0225M

An application for a permit and Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin was tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ron Martin was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection.

AS

W.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**W.13.1 Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 187, 18 Stadler Road, Bloubergstrand: MA
HM/BLOUBERGSTRAND/ERF 187**

Case No: 131031JW06E

Awaiting comments from conservation bodies

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

JW

**W.13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Van der Bijl Cottage, Erf 13190, 43 Market Street, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 13190**

Case No: 15020902JW0210E

Revised plans (drawing no: 080-13/01-PH2, 080-13/02-PH2, 080-13/03-PH2, 080-13/04-PH2 and 080-13/05-PH2) prepared by F. de Waal, dated 16 March 2015 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Ms Lize Malan was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

JW

**W.13.3 Proposed Repairs and Maintenance, Erf 1068, Simon's Town Library, St Georges Road, Simon's Town: MA
HM/SIMON'S TOWN/ERF 1068**

A heritage report prepared by Mike Scurr, Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, dated 11 March 2015 was tabled.

MS recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mrs Sjanel Martin (CoCT) was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the heritage consultant's recommendations outlined on pages 21-25 (Section 9) of the heritage report dated 11 March 2015 and prepared by RSA Architects.

JW

**W.13.4 Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 11306, Klein Constantia, Klein Constantia Street, Paarl: NM
HM/PAARL/ERF 11306**

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated December 2014 and application for a permit was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The DHF had requested that the item be removed from the agenda as it had not been given sufficient opportunity to comment.
- Email correspondence dated December 2015 indicated that the DHF had been given sufficient opportunity comment; the email had been forwarded to a previous email address that was still in use at the time.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit (SW, GJ, MS and SH).

JW

**W.13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 95146, Quad Building, UCT, Hiddingh Campus, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/HIDDINGH CAMPUS/ERF 95146**

Case No: 15021301JW0216M

An application for a permit, photographs and plans (drawing no: C-0001 and C-0002) prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, dated 1 December 2014 were tabled.

MS recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

JW

**W.13.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 174148, Morgenzon, 51 Sandown Road, Rondebosch: NM
HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 174148**

Case No: 15030306J0303M

An application for a permit and plans (drawing no: 0015/20101-01, 0015/20102-01 and 0015/20104-01) prepared by Kube Architecture, dated 23 October 2014 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Simon Mountford was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City has graded the building as IIIB and supported the proposals. The Committee supported the proposals and made recommendations as to the detail treatment of the new additions.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following:

- The façade treatment to the studio should be revised to reflect vertical proportions and a less industrial aesthetic and the openings to the ground floor should be considered in a similar contemporary way.
- Similarly, the veranda should be consistent in design approach to the studio.

The revised drawings must be submitted for approval.

JW

**W.13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 96180, 22, Gordon Street, Gardens: MA
HM/GARDENS/ERF 96180**

Case No: 14120907JW1212M

Revised plans were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

MS recused himself.

Mr William Baker and Mr Jeremy Acton were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to recommend that the input of a heritage architect be obtained to set out conservation parameters for the remedial work. Conservation parameters would need to be informed by a consideration of both intrinsic heritage values and the broader heritage context.

JW

**W.13.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 66, 5 Blackheath Road, Sea Point: NM
HM/SEA POINT/ERF 66**

Case No: 14060212NN0603E

An application for a permit photographs and plans (drawing no: 64.05, 64.06, 64.07 and 64.08) prepared by Rod Gurzynski Architect were tabled.

Mr Andrew September made a power-point presentation.

Mr David Tyrrel was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIB.

The Committee expressed concern regarding the impact of the proposals on a grade IIIB building and potential impacts on the streetscape.

It was resolved to undertake a site inspection.

AS

W.13.9 Proposed Alterations and Addition, Section 41 of Erf 3507, The Manor House, St Johns Estate, 9 Higgo Crescent, Higgovale: NM HM/HIGGOVALE/SECTION 41 OF ERF 3507

Case No: 15021201JW0227M

An application for a permit, photographs and plans (drawing no: SNW SC 100) prepared by Neilmarie Architects, dated December 2015, were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit (SW, GJ and MS).

It was requested that a copy of the previously approved plans be made available to Committee members prior to the site inspection

JW

W.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.14.1 None

W. 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.15.1 None

W.16. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.16.1 None

W.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.18.1 None

W.19. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.19.1 None

W.20. Other Matters

W.20.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.11.1 Application to Erect a New Traffic Signage in the Proclaimed Heritage Village of Elim, Western Cape: NM HM/ELIM

Photographs and plans prepared by HHO Africa Infrastructure Engineers in association with Piet Louw and Dave Dewar and OVP landscape Architects, dated March 2015 were tabled.

Mr Piet Louw made a power-point presentation.

Mr Piet Louw, Mr Leon Bester, Mr Schalk Carstens and Mr Johan Papendorp were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- It was clear that there had been positive interaction between the design and engineering team resulting in a proposal that addressed both heritage concerns and traffic engineering/safety standards.
- The impact of traffic signage had been carefully mitigated resulting in a proposal which significantly reduced visual cluttering within the historical precinct.
- The revised proposals allowed for more trees to be planted within historic precinct as part of an overall landscape plan. The consultants were commended on the high quality of the submission.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the location, board size and height, and lettering size of the proposed traffic signage.

The Committee resolved to approve the location and design principles of the proposed tourism signage. Any additional signage will need to be submitted for further approval as a separate application.

ZS

E.11.2 Application to Erect a Public Art Installation PharoX Star on Erf 1391, Signal Hill: MA HM/SIGNAL HILL/ERF 1391

Case No: 14091105GT0912M

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

The matter was removed from the agenda as it was still being dealt with by the Appeals Committee.

GT

E.12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.12.1 Proposed Demolition of Dwelling Erf 213, Piet Retief Street, Tulbagh: NM HM/TULBAGH/ERF 213

Case No: 15031006

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated March 2015 was tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be ungradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition.

ZS

E.12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 1359, 312 Main Road, Eastcliff, Hermanus: NM HM/HERMANUS/ERF 1359

Case No: 15022710GT0227M

A Heritage Statement prepared by Ron Martin Heritage Consultancy, dated 13 February 2015 was tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

Mr Ron Martin and Ms Gill Susman were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Overstrand Heritage Committee does not support the demolition.
- The building is graded IIIC in terms of approved Overstrand Heritage Survey.
- Additional information on the intrinsic value of the building would warrant a grade IIIB grading. Its intrinsic value is evident in terms of well-crafted period features including teak joinery, fire places and surrounds, leaded glass, well-proportioned colonnade and central court with coffered skylight. The core of building is a good example of an elaborated bungalow typology. While the building is screened from the Main Road by existing vegetation, the building occupies a landmark location at the 'knuckle' of the Main Road alignment.
- The Committee supports the recommendation of the Overstrand Heritage Committee that the building would benefit from adaptive reuse.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the demolition.

GT

**E.12.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 5028, Garmor House, 12 Plein Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 8028**

Case No: 14080803KR0808E

MS was not present for this item.

An application for a permit, photographs and plans were tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the work being monitored by an archaeologist and the submission of a report to HWC thereafter. Should any significant buried features or remains be identified during this process, HWC is to be notified, and the necessary permit applied for in terms of Section 35 of the NHRA.

ZS

E.13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**E.13.1 Proposed Phase III Internal Refurbishments at Mount Nelson Hotel 76 Orange Street, Gardens, Erven 94924-RE, 94933 and 94934: NM
HM/GARDENS/ERVEN 94924/94933/94934**

Case No: 15031108ZS0311M

An application and pictures prepared by Thorold Architects, dated 10 March 2015 were tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal on condition that the heritage architect is to remain appointed to monitor and consult on the work undertaken.

ZS

**E.13.2 Proposed Alterations to Dwelling Erf 1697, Franschoek: NM
HM/FRASCHOEK/ERF 1697**

Case No: 15030303GT0303M

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates Heritage management, dated March 2015 was tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the sash windows in the front facade being retained and wall nibs of a minimum 450mm to be retained for all walls removed in order to provide adequate lateral support.

GT

**E.13.3 Proposed alterations on Erf 1691, 26 Van der Stel Street, Mostertdrift, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1691**

Case No: 15021701GT0306M

An application and plans prepared by Carien van der Merwe Architects, dated 16-07-2012 were tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal subject to the following:

- The asymmetry of the front façade of the building is to be retained.
- The enclosure of the upper balcony and lower veranda must be set back behind the balustrade and decorative brackets to retain the expression of a balcony/veranda.
- Revised drawings must be submitted to HWC for stamping by the case officer.

GT

**E.13.4 Proposed Partial Demolitions, Additions, New Buildings, Restorations and Alterations on Erven 2455 and 2456, C/o Merriman Ave and Joubert Rd, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERVEN 2455/2546**

Case No: 15030607GT0309M

MS had indicated a prior interest in the matter, but was not present for the discussion.

A motivation prepared by Smuts De Kock Architects, dated January 2015 was tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals in their current form given the negative impact of the interventions to the historic corner building and the unsympathetic scale, form and architectural treatment of the new development. There is insufficient information on the significance of the two existing buildings but based on the information provided the proposals cannot be supported.

Revised proposals must be accompanied by an expanded heritage statement including a more detailed assessment of heritage significance of the site and its context and setting out parameters for an appropriate design response.

The Committee recommends that the expanded heritage statement include the input of a heritage consultant with architectural and urban design expertise. Revised proposals must be submitted to local conservation bodies for comment.

GT

E.14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.15.1 None

E.16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.16.1 None

E.17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.18.1 None

E.19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.19.1 None

E.20 NON COMPLIANCE

E.20.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **16H00**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 22 April 2015

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____