

**APPROVED DECISIONS OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 27 January 2016 at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices
of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**11.1 Erf 1113, 20 Brownlow Road, Tamboerskloof: MA
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/TAMBOERSKLOOF**

Case No: 15062408HB0625E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the revised proposals subject to the submission of final working drawings.

The Committee was of the opinion that the architectural approach was appropriate in this context and mitigated visual impacts on the house.

HB

**11.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9547, Stellenbosch Hotel, Andringa Street, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 9547**

Case No: 15120405

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ and SH).

HB

12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 1079, 28 Vredehoek Avenue, Vredehoek: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 1079**

Case NO: 15071004HB0715E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (SW, MS and PB).

HB

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 896, 9 Scholtz Road, Green Point: NM HM/GREEN POINT/ERF 896

Case No: 16011303KR0113E

DECISION

It was noted that the City has graded the building IIC. The Committee was of the opinion that the building and its context have insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal protection.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition.

KR

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 26939, 6 Roman Road, Observatory: NM HM/OBSEVATORY/ERF 26939

Case No: 15080413HB1022E

DECISION

The Committee was of the opinion that the building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant formal protection. However, the site is situated in an area with a consistency in building scale, massing, roof form and boundary treatment. Furthermore, the site is situated within an area with a high concentration of conservation worthy buildings.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition subject to the submission of proposals for the replacement building for approval by HWC. This is to ensure that the replacement building responds positively to the character of the historical built environment.

HB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Erf 1847 - Constantia Nek Restaurant: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CONSTANTIA / ERF 1847

Case No: 15111707WD1118E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request revised proposals to address the following concerns:

- The junction of the kitchen addition with the gable end of the historical building.
- The overhead bulkhead within the restaurant space.
- The proposed glass entrance.
- The scale and massing of the kitchen addition.
- Detailing of remedial work to the internal roof carpentry.

The Committee resolved to meet on site to clarify the concerns raised.

The Committee requested that the revised proposals be made available prior to the site meeting.

WD

**13.2 Proposed Alterations at Erven 567/7/8, 31 Belvedere Road, Oranjezicht: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERVEN 567/7/8**

Case No: 14072812JW0909E

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building, its garden setting and the boundary wall to be grade II in terms of its exceptional architectural, quality, detailing and intactness and location within a highly significant streetscape.

The Committee decided to approve the proposals given that they are located to the rear of the building and will not be visible from the street. Given the high heritage significance of the building approval is granted subject to the work being overseen by an architect with heritage experience and that a closeout report be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

JW

**13.3 Proposed Revised Plans for Namaqua House, Erf 116120, Corner Short Market and Burg Streets, Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ERF116120**

Case Number: 15052607KR0526E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to support the concept proposals in principle and that final drawings be submitted to the Committee for approval.

KR

**13.4 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions and Restorations, Erf 177447, The Granary, 11 Buitenkant Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ ERF 177447**

Case No: 15080507HB0812M

DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the approach and principles contained within the progress report and commended the architect for the quality of the report.

The Committee noted that the scope of work is pitched at a high level and that more detailed technical information including the extent of timber to be replaced will be decided as work progresses

HB

**13.5 Erf 156896, 47 Bree Str, Cape Town Illegal Work: NM
CAPE METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERF 156896**

Case No: 15091104HB0915E

DECISION

The Committee noted that the City has graded the building IIIC. While the committee is in agreement with this grading, the significance of the building is not limited to the

front façade but includes the exterior envelope of the building and remaining interior period elements.

The building has been subject to incremental alterations that have had a cumulative negative impact on the significance of the building. Remaining period features including fenestration, the timber staircase and fire place therefore contribute even more strongly to its historical character. Their removal would further detract from the significance of the building.

The Committee cannot condone illegal work and recommends that HWC lay charges in terms of Section 51 of the NHRA.

The Committee resolved not to approve any proposed interventions without a holistic approach that includes remedial work to potentially recover significance including, for example, the reinstatement of the windows.

HB

**13.6 Erf 408 - 8 Irwinton Road Fresnaye: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ FRESNAYE/ ERF 408**

Case No: 15111707WD1118E

DECISION

The Committee noted that the City has graded the building IIIC. However the Committee was of the opinion that the building is worthy of grade III B in terms of its intact ground floor including period features. The Committee raised concerns regarding the removal of the fire places on the ground floor and the extent of wall fabric being removed and the impact that this would have on the integrity of the historic fabric and the legibility of the internal layout of the ground floor.

The Committee was of the opinion that alternative proposals addressing these concerns can be accommodated.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the following:

- The retention of the fireplaces.
- The significant reduction in wall fabric being removed.
- The retention of the overall internal layout of the ground floor.

The revised proposals must be submitted to the Committee for approval.

WD

**13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions at Erf 2764, 20 La Ferme Chantelle, Main Street, Franschhoek: NM
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 2764**

Case No: 15062217JW0622E

DECISION

There was insufficient information for the Committee to suggest a grading but it was previously determined by HWC that the site should be grade IIIB.

The Committee decided not to approve the proposals in the current form and to require the following:

- Set of measured drawings together with an assessment of original intact fabric and elements.
- The engagement of an architect with heritage experience to advise with regard to an appropriate methodology for fabric interventions and heritage related specifications.
- An evaluation of the building in relation to the werf and its contribution to its character and significance in order to inform the proposed interventions to the building

The Committee resolved that revised proposals be submitted for approval

JW

**13.8 Proposed Partial Demolition & Additions to existing Structure on Erf 1827, 50 Constantia Road, Gardens: NM
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ERF 1827**

Case No: 15102804HB1110E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site visit (SW, PB and MS).

HB

**13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 398, 6 Lodge Road, Oranjezicht: NM
HM\CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN\ORANJEZICHT\ERF 398**

Case No: 15082002GT1014E

DECISION

The Committee resolved to request further information in order to assess the visual impact of both alternative proposals on the context. The Committee requires the submission of 3D photo-montage images taken from the street.

GT

**13.10 Portion 6 of Farm 173 Langerug-Landbouskool Boland-Paarl: NM
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ PORTION 6 OF FARM 173
LANGERUG**

Case No: 15120909WD1209E

DECISION

The Committee noted that the building is graded IIIC in terms of the approved Drakenstein Heritage Survey.

The Committee welcomed the intention to rehabilitate the heritage significance of the building. However, the Committee requires further information on the conservation approach taking into account the status of original and later fabric. The Committee requests the submission of a Heritage Statement prepared by an architect with heritage expertise.

WD

**13.11 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9703, Church Square, 5 Church Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERF 9703**

Case No: 16011302HB0113M

DECISION

The Committee noted that the City has graded the building grade IIIA.

The Committee raised a number of concerns with the proposals:

- The projecting balconies on the 2nd and 3rd floors will have a significant negative impact on the architectural character of the front façade and Church Square and are therefore not supported.
- The proposed new openings on the ground floor are unresolved and if agreed to at all would require a much clearer understanding of the detailing and proportioning of the front façade.
- The proposed additional floors are supported in principle but not in terms of the current design. While the committee supports a contemporary expression this needs to relate more sympathetically to the building fabric and Church Square.

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposals in their current form and requested that revised proposals be submitted for approval

HB

**13.12 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 4150, 248 Butengracht, Bo-Kaap: NM
HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 4150**

Case No: 15111716

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the final drawings involving the input from a structural engineer and being submitted to HWC for stamping by the case officer.

HB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **16 h 35**

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 24 February 2016

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____