

**MINUTES OF MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 15 August 2012, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09H06 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Ms Melanie Attwell	MA
Mr Roger Joshua	RJ
Mr Patrick Fefeza	PF
Dr Stephen Townsend	ST
Ms Maureen Wolters	MW
Mr Trevor Thorold	TT

Members of Staff

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Mr Calvin van Wijk	CvW
Ms Tamar Grover	TG
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Olwethu Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Ms Ntombi Nkoane	NN
Mr Shaun Dyers	SD
Ms Laura Bridgeman	LB

Visitors

Prof Fabio Todeschini
Ms Anne-Marie Fick
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Peter Kantor

Mr Mike Scurr
Ms Corlie Smart
Mrs Claire Donovan
Mr Michael Dall
Ms Yvonne Leibman

Observers

Mr Philip Smith (City of Cape Town)

3. Apologies

Mr Tim Hart

4. Approval of minutes of previous meeting held 18 July 2012

4.1 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with no amendments.

5. Confidential Matters

5.1 None

6. Administration Matters

6.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The CEO gave a report back on the outcome of the following appeal cases:

- Erf 412, Corner of La Provence & Stiebeuel Streets, Groendal, Franschhoek;
- Erf 9794 and Rem Erf 10829, Steenberg Farm, Constantia;
- Removal of Unauthorised Parasols to the front of Alphen homestead;

- Erf 337, Constantia; and
- Erf 4150, Buitengracht Street, Cape Town.

6.2 MEC regulations and approvals of unauthorised works

The Committee resolved that the matter regarding revising the MEC regulations to enable HWC to approve or refuse unauthorised works be tabled at the next Council meeting.

6.3 Homestead, Main Road, St James

The committee agreed that a stop works order is to be issued as soon as possible.

7. Appointments

7.1 The Committee noted the appointment for item W.12.4 at 11H00.

8. Disclosure of Interest

- W.10.3, W10.4 & W12.5 (Mr Trevor Thorold recused himself).
- W.10.2 (Ms Sarah Winter recused herself and Dr Townsend will take the chair for this item).

9. Approval of Agenda

The Committee agreed to approve the agenda with additional items.

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W. 10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 251, Boomstraat 40, Elim: MA HM/ELIM/ERF 251

Case No: 110727JW34M

An application and plans prepared by Mr P.K Siebrits were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, RJ and TT.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIB within a Grade IIIA area and is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the inclusion of a parapet on the rear addition, that the roof form of the main building be retained and that the corrugated iron be painted black or dark grey.

Revised plans can be approved by the case officer.

JW

**W.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Alphen Estate, Erf 377, Alphen Drive and Peter Cloete Avenue, Constantia: MA
HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 377**

Report accompanying Annexure A, prepared by Claire Donovan, dated August 2012 was tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST and RJ.

Ms Sarah Winter recused herself and Dr Townsend took the chair.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- No comments from SPM and CPOA had been submitted

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II and is a declared PHS.

The Committee resolved:

- To approve the Option A proposal.
- The registered conservation body for the area had not been given option to comment but must be given the right of appeal

TG

**W.10.3 Proposed Restoration - Localised Repairs, Redecoration (Limewashing) of Mill-Race & Werf Walls, Elsenburg Agricultural College, Elsenburg Farm A known as Rem of the Farm Elsenburg 34, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ELSENBURG FARM A**

Case No: 120801TG02M

Partial Specifications, prepared by Trevor Thorold, dated June 2012 and Annexure A, prepared by Trevor Thorold, dated 31 July 2012 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, RJ and SW.

Mr Trevor Thorold recused himself.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

**W.10.4 Proposed Landscaping, Elsenburg Agricultural College, Elsenburg Farm A, known as Rem of the Farm Elsenburg 34, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ELSENBURG FARM A**

Case No: 120801TG02M

Outline Appraisal & Landscaping Proposals prepared by Trevor Thorold, dated September 2005 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, RJ and SW.

Mr Trevor Thorold recused himself.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

**W.10.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, St Mary's on the Braak Anglican Church, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ST MARY'S ON THE BRAAK ANGLICAN CHURCH**

Case No: 110727TG32

Revised Drawings prepared by HB Architects were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, RJ and ST.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade II and it is a PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

TG

W. 11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 None

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Weltevreden Farm, Ptn 14 of Farm 1646,
R45 Franschoek: NM
HM/FRANSCHHOEK/WELTEVREDEN FARM/PTN 14 OF FARM 1646**

Case No: 120731JW30

An application for a permit, prepared by Johan Christian Fick, dated 30 July 2012, I&AP's comments, dated 3 July, plans and photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, ST and RJ.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Franschoek Valley Conservation Trust and Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation supported the proposal.
- The Stellenbosch Interest Group had a number of concerns with the proposals.
- Landscaping should be given attention.
- Parking is not indicated on the plans.
- The submission is incomplete in terms of proper contextual plans and site plans.

INETERIM RESOLUTION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit (TT, RJ and MW) and to request further contextual information including a comprehensive site location plan and referencing of source documentation. Parking requirements and landscaping should be included.

JW

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Les Maris, Erf 8906, 5 Suzanne Road,
Constantia: NM
HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 8906**

Case No: 120731JW31M

An application for a permit, prepared by Johan Christian Fick, dated 30 July 2012, plans and photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, ST and RJ.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The CPOA has no objection to the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be Grade IIIA.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as heritage significance is not affected.

JW

**W.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 170312 & 170613, Cnr Lever Road & Rosemead Road, Cnr Lever & Rouxville Road, Kalk Bay: NM
HM/KALK BAY/ERF 170312 & 176313**

Case No: 120709TG12M

A Draft Heritage Statement prepared by Andrew Berman, dated June 2012, an application for permit, plans and photographs were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT, MA and RJ.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The local conservation body and the CoCT (SPA, Heritage Section) have no objection to the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be Grade IIIC (with more historical information, possibly IIIB) and recognise that the building is in a conservation area.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

**W.12.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Old Sillery, Erf 2305, Constantia: MA
HM/CONSTANTIA/ERF 2305**

Case No: 120208TG06

A Stage 1 Report, prepared by Claire Donovan, dated 10 July 2012 and sketch drawings prepared by Claire Donovan (Dwg No AH/10/2012) were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, ST and TT.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

Prof Fabio Todeschini, representing the CPOA, Mr Michael Dall and Mr Peter Kantor representing the owner, were present and participated in the discussion.

COMMENT

The Committee commented as follows:

- Option C is the preferred option as it retrieves heritage significance with respect to the form of the historical core;
- The internal structural arrangements of the house need to be further resolved; and
- Detailed plans must be submitted together with the comments of the registered heritage conservation body.

TG

**W.12.5 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Renovation to three Buildings on Delta Meer, Rem of Ptn 4 of the Farm Delta Meer No 1460, Delta Minor Road, off R45, Groot Drakenstein: MA
HM/GROOT DRAKENSTEIN/REM OF PTN 4 OF THE FARM DELTAMEER No 1460**

Case No: 120712TG14M

Report on Research Excavation prepared by Kathryn Smuts, dated 26 March 2012, an Application for Permit prepared by Trevor Thorold, dated 11 July 2012, photographs and plans were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, RJ and SW.

Mr Trevor Thorold recused himself.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Comments from local conservation bodies should be provided.
- The Grade 1 status of the area needs to be clarified.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be Grade IIIB as part of Grade IIIA immediate environs and inside a Grade I landscape.

The Committee resolved to await comment from SAHRA (if necessary) and local conservation bodies and the committee will make the decision via email.

TG

**W.12.6 Proposed Restoration Process for City of Cape Town Properties, Bo-Kaap: MA
HM/BOKAAP**

Case No: 120619TG18M

A Background Report, Inventory, and a Report on Existing Housing Conditions and Assessment of Recommended Work for Erf 142716, 40 Rose Street, Bo Kaap, prepared by the City of Cape Town were tabled.

The documentation had been circulated to by email.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- This is a Grade I area.
- The process involves 19 City owned properties in Bo-Kaap.
- Erf 142716, 40 Rose Street, Bo-Kaap is a pilot project.

DECISION

The Committee supported the proposed process and recommended that consultation with SAHRA be included. HWC insists that the City of Cape Town ensure that no work be carried without HWC approval.

TG

W.12.7 Proposed Alterations and Erection of New Buildings on Erven 45360 & 44298, Rustenberg Girls High School, Camp Ground Road, Rondebosch: MA HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERVEN 45360 & 44298

Case No: 110930TG13

Campus Development Plans prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff, dated July 2012 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by TT & RJ.

Ms Tamar Grover made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee decided the grading of the site to be Grade IIIA.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

TG

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 None

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 Proposed New Restaurant Building and Playground Equipment, Erf 13836, Weltevreda, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 13836

Case No: 120606SD03M

Revised Drawings and a Heritage Report prepared by Corlie Smart of Smart Attorneys in association with Stuart Hermansen of HB Architects, dated July 2012 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, SW and RJ.

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation.

Mr Stuart Hermansen and Ms Corlie Smart were present and participated in the discussion,

DECISION

The Committee decided the site be graded as Grade II and is a declared PHS.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal in principle and requires the submission of landscaping proposals and final detailed drawings.

SD

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 None

E. 12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.12.1 Proposed Alterations the Dwelling and Outbuilding, Erf 2796, Franschhoek: NM HM/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 2796

A Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates Heritage Management, dated June 2012 was tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by MA, SW and TT.

Mr Shaun Dyers made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee disagreed in a number of aspects and voted on the matter, and the majority were in favour of the proposals.
- Mr Thorold and Ms Wolters did not support the proposals.

DECISION

The Committee decided the site be graded as Grade IIIB

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the side wings being set back by 500 mm.

SD

**E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Klein Constantia Estate, Farm 1121, Klein Constantia Road, Constantia: NM
HM/CONSTANTIA/FARM 1121**

Case No: 120229NN28M

Heritage Statement prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, dated 04 July 2012 and an application for permit, prepared by Christiaan van Aswegen, dated 28 February 2012 were tabled.

The documents had been delivered to and read by ST, MA and SW.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

Mr Mike Scurr, the heritage architect, and Ms Yvonne Leibman, representing the CPOA were present and participated in the discussion.

COMMENT

The Committee decided the site be graded as Grade II within a Grade I context.

The Committee commented as follows:

- It supported the proposal in principle subject to detailed proposals being submitted for approval.
- The Committee requires that the architectural team be complemented by an appropriately experienced conservation architect as is Mr Scurr.
- That the archaeological investigations will require a S35 application to SAHRA.

SD

**E.12.3 Erf, 426, Main Road, Paarl
HM/PAARL/ERF 426**

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

The documents had been delivered to and read by SW, ST and TT.

DECISION

The Committee decided the site be graded as grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as heritage significance of building and its context is not affected.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at **15H00**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 19 September 2012

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____